A methodology and software environment
for testing process model's sequential predictions
with protocols

Frank E. Ritter

20 December 1992
CMU-CS-93-101

School of Computer Science
Carnegie Mellon University
Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Submitted to the Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Psychology in the AI and Psychology program

References

Stobie, I., Tambe, M., and Rosenbloom, P. (November 1992). Flexible integration of path-planning capabilities. *Proceedings of the SPIE conference on Mobile Robots.* .

Afifi, A., & Clark, V. (1984). *Computer-aided Multivariate Analysis.* New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Company.

Altmann, E. (February, 1992). Toward Human-scale task performance: Preliminaries. Talk presented at the Soar X workshop.

Anderson, J. R. (1983). *The architecture of cognition.* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Anderson, J. R. (in press). *Rules of the Mind.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Anderson, J. R., & Bower, G. H. (1973). *Human associative memory.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. Third revised printing 1979.

Anderson, J. R., Conrad, F. G., & Corbett, A. T. (1989). Skill acquisition and the LISP tutor. *Cognitive Science, 13*(4), 467-505.

Anderson, J. R., Farrell, R., & Sauers, R. (1981). Learning to program in Lisp. *Cognitive Science, 8,* 87-129.

Anderson, J. R., Greeno, J. G., Kline, P. J., & Neves, D. M. (1981). Acquisition of problem-solving skill. In Anderson, J. R. (Ed.), *Cognitive skills and their acquisition.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Anjewierden, A., Wielemaker, J., & Toussaint, C. (1990). Shelley — Computer aided knowledge engineering. In Wielinga, B., Boose, J. H., Gaines, B. R., Schreiber, G, & van Someren, M. (Eds.), *Current trends in Knowledge acquisition (Proceedings of the 4rth European workshop on knowledge acquisition, EKAW-90, Amsterdam.* Amsterdam: IOS Press.

Anzai, Y., & Simon, H. A. (1979). The theory of learning by doing. *Psychological Review, 86,* 124-140.

Ardis, M. A. (1987). Template-Mode for GNU Emacs. Available from The Ohio State University elisp archives on archive.cis.ohio-state.edu as file pub/gnu/emacs/elisp-archive/modes/templatemode.tar.Z.

Atwood, M. E., & Poulson, P. G. (1976). A process model for water jug problems. *Cognitive Psychology, 8,* 191-216.

Bates, D., Kademan, E., & Ritter, F. E. (Fall 1990, revised Fall 1991). *S-mode for GNU Emacs.* Available from the Statlib software archive (S is a statistics package, Statlib is statlib@lib.stat.cmu.edu).

Becker, R.A., Chambers, J.M., & Wilks, A.R. (1988). *The New S Language.* Pacific Grove, CA: Wadsworth and Brooks/Cole.

Bentler, P. M. (1980). Multivariate analysis with latent variables: Causal modeling. *Annual Review of Psychology, 31,* 419-456.

Bhaskar, R. (1978). *Problem solving in semantically rich domains.* Doctoral dissertation, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Bhaskar, R., & Simon, H. A. (1977). Problem solving in semantically rich domains: An example from engineering thermodynamics. *Cognitive Science, 1,* 193-215.

Bree, D. S. (1968). *The understanding process as seen in geometry theorems.* Doctoral dissertation, Carnegie Mellon University.

Brooks, F. P. (1975). *The mythical man-month: Essays on software engineering.* Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Pub. Co.

Brown, C. R. (1986). The verbal protocol analysis tool (VPA): Some formal methods for describing expert behavior. In *Proceedings 2nd Symposium on Human Interface, Oct. 29-30, Tokyo, Japan,* 561-567.

Brown, J. S., & Burton, R. B. (1980). Diagnostic models for procedural bugs in basic mathematical skills. *Cognitive Science, 2,* 155-192.

Brueker, J., & Wielinga, B. (1989). Models of expertise in knowledge acquisition. In Guida, G., & Tasso, C. (Eds.), *Topics in expert system design.* North Holland: Elsevier Science Publishers B.V.

Card, S. K., Moran, T. P., & Newell, A. (1980). The keystroke-level model for user performance time with interactive systems. *Communications of the ACM,* Vol. *23*(7).

Card, S., Moran, T., & Newell, A. (1983). *The psychology of human-computer interaction.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Carley, K. (1988). Formalizing the social expert's knowledge. *Sociological methods and research, 17*(2), 165-232.

Carpenter, P. A., Just, M. A., & Shell, P. (1990). Cognitive coordinate systems: Accounts of mental rotation and individual differences in spatial ability. *Psychological Review, 92,* 137-172.

Chambers, J.M., & Hastie, T.J., eds. (1992). *Statistical Models in S.* Pacific Grove, CA: Wadsworth and Brooks/Cole.

Cohen, M. S., Payne, D. G., & Pastore, R. E. (1991). Computerized task analysis. *SIGCHI Bulletin, 23*(4), 57-58.

Corsaro, W. A., & Heise, D. R. (1990). Event structure models from ethnographic data. In Clogg, C. (Ed.), *Sociological methodology: 1990.* Cambridge, MA: Basil Blackwell.

Dansereau, D. (1969). *An information processing model of mental multiplication.* Doctoral dissertation, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Diederich, J., Ruhmann, I, & May, M. (1987). KRITON: A knowledge-acquisition tool for expert systems. *International Journal of Man-Machine Studies, 26,* 29-40.

Dillard, J. F., Bhaskar, R., & Stephens, R. G. (1982). Using first-order cognitive analysis to understand problem solving behavior: An example from accounting. *Instructional Science, 11*(1), 71-92.

Doorenbos, R., Tambe, M., & Newell, A. (1992). Learning 10,000 chunks: What's it like out there? *Proceedings of the Tenth National Conference on Artificial Intelligence.* AAAI.

Dukes, N. F. (1968). N=1. *Psychological Bulletin, 64*(1), 74-79.

Embretson, S. E. (1992). Computerized adaptive testing: Its potential substantive contributions to psychological research and assessment. *Current directions in psychological science, 1*(4), 129-131.

Ericsson, K. A., & Simon, H. A. (1980). Protocol analysis: Verbal reports as data. *Psychological Review*, *87*, 215-251.

Ericsson, K. A., & Simon, H. A. (1984). *Protocol analysis: Verbal reports as data.* Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Feigenbaum, E. A., & Simon, H. S. (1984). EPAM-like models of recognition and learning. *Cognitive Science, 8*, 305-336.

Feldman, J. (1962). Computer simulation of cognitive processes. In Borko, H. (Ed.), *Computer applications in the behavioral sciences*. Englewood cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Feldman, J., Tonge, F. M., & Kanter, H. (1991). Empirical explorations of a hypothesis-testing model of binary choice behavior. Hoggatt, A. C., & Balderston, F. E. (Eds.), *Symposium on simulation models*. Cincinnati, OH, South-Western Publishing Company.

Fielding, N. G., & Lee, R. M. (Eds.). (1991). *Using computers in qualitative research.* London & Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Finlay, J., & Harrison, M. (1990). Pattern recognition and interaction models. Diaper, D., et al. (Eds.), *Human-computer interaction — INTERACT '90.* IFIP, Elsevier Science Publishers B. V.

Fisher, C. (1987). Advancing the study of programming with computer-aided protocol analysis. In Olson, G., Soloway, E., & Sheppard, S. (Eds.), *Empirical studies of programmers: Second workshop*. Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

Fisher, C. (1991). *Protocol Analyst's Workbench: Design and evaluation of computer-aided protocol analysis.* Doctoral dissertation, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Forgy, C. L. (1981). *OPS5 user's manual* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-81-135. Department of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Free Software Foundation.   (1988). *GNU Emacs.* Boston: Free Software Foundation. Directions for obtaining GNU-Emacs are available by FTPing file /pub/gnu/GNUinfo/FTP on prep.ai.mit.edu, using the anonymous FTP protocol.

Garey, M. R., & Johnson, D. S. (1979). *Computers and intractability: A guide to the theory of NP-Completeness.* New York, New York: W. H. Freeman and Company.

Garlick, S. & VanLehn, K. (1987). *CIRRUS: An automated protocol analysis tool* (Tech. Rep.) 6. Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Gascon, J. (1976). *Computerized protocol analysis of the behavior of children on a weight seriation task.* Doctoral dissertation, Departement de Psychologie, Université de Montréal.

Gottman, J. M., & Roy, A. K. (1990). *Sequential analysis: A guide for behavioral researchers.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Grant, D. A. (1962). Testing the null hypothesis and the strategy and tactics of investigating theoretical models. *Psychological Review, 69*, 54-61.

Greenblatt, R. D., Knight, T. F. Jr., Holloway, J., Moon, D. A., & Weinreb, D. L. (1984). The LISP machine. In Barstow, D. R., Shrobe, H. E., & Sandewall, E. (Eds.), *Interactive programming environments*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.

Greeno, J. G., and Simon, H. A. (1984). Problem solving and reasoning. In Atkinson, R. C., Herrnstein, G., Lindzey, G., and Luce, R. D. (Eds.), *Stevens' handbook of experimental psychology, 2nd edition, Volume II.* New York, NY: John Wiley & Sons. Also available as tech

report UPITT/LRDC/ONR/APS-14.

Gregg, L. W., & Simon, H. S. (1967). An information-processing explanation of one-trial and incremental learning. *Journal of Verbal Learning and Verbal Behavior, 6*, 780-787.

Hall, S. (1992). How technique is changing science. *Science, 257*, 344-349.

Hansen, J. P. (1991). The use of eye mark recordings to support verbal retrospection in software testing. *Acta Psychologica, 76*, 31-49.

Hegarty, M. (1988). *Comprehension of diagrams accompanied by text.* Doctoral dissertation, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Heise, D. R. (August 1987). Computer assisted analysis of qualitative field data, Didactic seminar, Session 176, American Sociological Association, Chicago.

Heise, D. R. (1989). Modeling event structures. *Journal of Mathematical Sociology, 14*(2-3), 139-169.

Heise, D. R. (1991). Event structure analysis: A qualitative model of quantitative research. In Fielding, N. G., & Lee, R. M. (Eds.), *Using computers in qualitative research.* London: Sage.

Heise, D., & Lewis, E. (1991). *Introduction to ETHNO.* Dubuque, Iowa: Wm. C. Brown Publishers.

Hinton, G. E., & Sejnowski, T. J. (1986). Learning and relearning in Boltzmann Machines. In *Parallel distributed processing: Explorations in the microstructure of cognition. Volume 1: Foundations.* Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press.

Hirschberg, D. S. (1975). A linear space algorithm for computing maximal common subsequences. *Communications of the ACM, 18*(6), 341-343.

James, J. M., Sanderson, P. M., & Seidler, K. S. (1990). *SHAPA Version 2.0: Instruction manual and reference* (Tech. Rep.) EPRL-90-16/M. Engineering Psychology Research Laboratory.

Jefferys, W. H., & Berger, J. O. (1992). Ockham's Razor and Bayesian Analysis. *American Scientist, 80*(January-February), 64-72.

John, B. E. (1988). *Contributions to engineering models human-computer interactions, Volume 1.* Doctoral dissertation, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

John, B. E. (1990). Applying cognitive theory to the evaluation and design of human-computer interfaces. Final report to US West sponsored research program.

John, B. E., & Vera, A. H. (May 1992). A GOMS analysis of a graphic, machine-paced, highly interactive task. *CHI'92 Proceedings of the Conference on Human Factors and Computing Systems.* NewYork: SIGCHI, ACM Press.

John, B. E., Vera, A. H., & Newell, A. (December 1990). *Toward Real-Time GOMS* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-90-195. School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

John, B.E., Remington, R.W. & Steier, D.M. (May 1991). *An Analysis of Space Shuttle Countdown Activities: Preliminaries to a Computational Model of the NASA Test Director* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-91-138. School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Johnson, T. R., & Smith, J. W. (1991). A Framework for Opportunistic Abductive Strategies. *Proceedings of the Thirteenth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society.* Hillsdale, New Jersey: Cognitive Science Society, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Johnson, P. E., Dura'n, A. S., Hassebrock, F., Moller, J., Prietula, M., Feltovich, P. J., Swanson, D. B. (1981). Expertise and error in diagnostic reasoning. *Cognitive Science, 5,* 235-283.

Just, M. A., & Carpenter, P. A. (1980). A theory of reading: From eye fixations to comprehension. *Psychological Review, 87*(4), 329-354.

Just, M. A., & Carpenter, P. A. (1985). Cognitive coordinate systems: Accounts of mental rotation and individual differences in spatial ability. *Psychological Review, 92*(2), 137-172.

Just, M. A., & Carpenter, P. A. (1987). *The psychology of reading and language comprehension.* Newton, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

Just, M. A., & Carpenter, P. A. (1992). A capacity theory of comprehension: Individual differences in working memory. *Psychological Review, 99,* 122-149.

Just, M. A., & Thibadeau, R. A. (1984). Developing a computer model of reading times. In Kieras, D. E., & Just, M. A. (Eds.), *New methods in reading comprehension research.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Kadane, J. B., Larkin, J. H., & Mayer, R. H. (1981). A moving average model for sequenced reaction-time data. *Journal of Mathematical Psychology, 23*(2), 115-133.

Kaplan, C. (1987). Computer simulation: Separating fact from fiction. Published as Technical report #498 in the C. I. P. Series, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Karat, J. (1968). A model of problem solving with incomplete constraint knowledge. *Cognitive Psychology, 14,* 538-559.

Kennedy, S. (1989). Using video in the BNR usability lab. *SIGCHI Bulletin, 21*(2), 92-95.

Kiearas, D. (May 1992). Personal communication.

Klahr, D., & Dunbar, K. (1988). Dual space search during scientific reasoning. *Cognitive Science, 12*(1), 1-48.

Koedinger, K. R., & Anderson, J. R. (1990). Abstract planning and perceptual chunks: Elements of expertise in geometry. *Cognitive Science, 14*(4), 511-550.

Kolen, J. F., & Pollack, J. B. (1988). Scenes from exclusive-or: Back propagation is sensitive to initial conditions. *Proceedings of the Twelfth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society.* Cognitive Science, LEA.

Kowalski, B., & VanLehn, K. (1988). Cirrus: Inducing subject models from protocol data. *Proceedings of the Tenth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society.* Cognitive Science, LEA.

Krishnan, R., Li, X., & Steier, D. M. (September 1992). Development of a knowledge-based mathematical model formulation system. *Communications of the ACM, 35*(9), 138-146.

Kulkarni, D., & Simon, H. A. (1988). The process of scientific discovery: The strategy of experimentation. *Cognitive Science, 12,* 139-176.

Laird, J. E., & Rosenbloom, P. S. (1992). In pursuit of mind: The research of Allen Newell. To appear in *AI Magazine.*

Laird, J.E., Congdon, C.B., Altmann, E. & Swedlow, K. (October 1990). *Soar User's Manual: Version 5.2* (Tech. Rep.) CSE-TR-72-90. Electrical Engineering and Computer Science Department, University of Michigan. Also available from The Soar Project, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University, as technical report CMU-CS-90-179.

Laird, J. E., Newell, A., & Rosenbloom, P. S. (1987). Soar: An architecture for general intelligence. *Artificial Intelligence*, *33*(1), 1-64.

Langley, P., & Ohlsson, S. (1989). Automated cognitive modeling. *Proceedings of AAAI-84*. Los Altos, CA, Morgan Kaufman.

Langley, P., Bradshaw, G. L., & Simon, H. A. (1983). Rediscovering chemistry with the Bacon system. In Michalski, R. S., Carbonell, J. G., & Mitchell, T. M. (Eds.), *Machine learning, an artificial intelligence approach*. Palo Alto, CA: Tioga.

Larkin, J. H. (1981). Enriching formal knowledge: A model for learning to solve textbook physics problems. In Anderson, J. R. (Ed.), *Cognitive skills and their acquisition*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Larkin, J. H., & Simon, H. A. (1981). Learning through growth of skill in mental modeling. *In Proceedings of the Third annual conference of the Cognitive Science Society*. Cognitive Science Society, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Larkin, J. H., & Simon, H. A. (1987). Why a diagram is (sometimes) worth ten thousand words. *Cognitive Science*, *11*, 65-99.

Larkin, J. H., Mayer, R. H., & Kadane, J. B. (1986). An information-processing model based on reaction times in solving linear equations. *Journal of Mathematical Psychology*, *23*(2), 115-133.

Larkin, J. H., McDermott, J., Simon, D. P., & Simon, H. A. (1980). Models of competence in solving physics problems. *Cognitive Science*, *4*, 317-345.

Lehman, J. F., Lewis, R. L., & Newell, A. (1991). Integrating knowledge sources in language comprehension. *Proceedings of the Thirteenth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society*. .

Levy, B. (Fall 1991). Able Soar Jr: A model for learning to solve kinematic problems. Final project for PSY 85-711: Cognitive processes and problem solving.

Lewis, R. L., Huffman, S. B., John, B. E., Laird, J. E., Lehman, J. F., Newell, A., Rosenbloom, P. S., Simon, T., & Tessler, S. G. (July 1990). Soar as a Unified Theory of Cognition: Spring 1990. *Proceedings of the Twelfth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society*. Cambridge, MA.

Lewis, R. L., Newell, A., & Polk, T. A. (1989). Toward a Soar theory of taking instructions for immediate reasoning tasks. *Proceedings of the Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society*. Hillsdale, New Jersey: Cognitive Science Society, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Lueke, E., Pagerey, P. D., & Brown, C. R. (1987). User requirements gathering through verbal protocol analysis. In Salvendy, G. (Ed.), *Cognitive Engineering in the Design of Human-Computer Interaction and Expert Systems*. Amsterdam: Elsevier Science Publishers.

Luger, G. F. (1981). Mathematical model building in the solution of mechanics problems: Human protocols and the MECHO trace. *Cognitive Science*, *5*, 55-77.

Mackay, W. (1989). EVA: An experimental video annotator for symbolic analyses of video data. *SIGCHI Bulletin*, *21*(2), 68-71.

MacWhinney, B. (1991). *The CHILDES project: Tools for analyzing talk*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

MacWhinney, B., & Snow, C. (1990). The Child Language Data Exchange System: An update. *Journal of Child Language*, *17*, 457-472.

McClelland, J. L., & Rumelhart, D. E. (1988). *Explorations in parallel distributed processing: A handbook of models, programs, and exercises*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press.

McClelland, J. L., Rumelhart, D. E., & the PDP research group. (1986). *Parallel distributed processing: Explorations in the microstructure of cognition. Volume 2: Psychological and biological models*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: The MIT Press.

McConnell, C. (Spring 1992). *Ilisp: Fancy LISP interface for GNU Emacs that supports multiple dialects* (Version 4.12). Available from The Ohio State University elisp archives on archive.cis.ohio-state.edu as file pub/gnu/emacs/elisp-archive/packages/ilisp.tar.Z, and from katmandu.mt.cs.cmu.edu:/pub/ilisp/ilisp.tar.Z.

Miller, C. S., & Laird, J. E. (1991). A Constraint-Motivated Model of Lexical Acquisition. *Proceedings of the thirteenth annual conference of the Cognitive Science Society*. Cognitive Science, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Milnes, B. G. (1988). The Soar Graphic Interface. Talk and demo presented at the Soar V Workshop.

Miwa, K., & Simon, H. A. (1992). Measuring individual differences by modifying production systems. Submitted for publication.

Motta, E., Eisenstadt M., Pitman, K., & West, M. (1988). Support for knowledge acquisition in the Knowledge Engineer's Assistant (KEATS). *Expert Systems, 5*, 6-28.

Myers, B. A., & Rossen, M. B. (May 1992). Survey on user interface programming. *CHI'92 Proceedings of the Conference on Human Factors and Computing Systems*. New York, ACM Press, Also available as Carnegie-Mellon School of Computer Science technical report CMU-CS-92-113.

Myers, B. A., Giuse, D. A., Dannenberg, R. B., Vander Zanden, V., Kosbie, D. S., Pervin, E., Mickish, A., & Marchal, P. (November 1990). Garnet: Comprehensive Support for Graphical, Highly-Interactive User Interfaces. *IEEE Computer, 23*(11), 71-85.

Myers, B. A., Guise, D., Dannenberg, R. B., Vander Zanden, B., Kosbie, D., Marchal, P., Pervin, E., Mickish, A., Kolojejchick, J. A. (1991). *The Garnet toolkit reference manuals, revised for Version 1.4* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-90-117-R. School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Neches, R. (1982). A process model for water jug problems. *Behavior research methods & instrumentation, 14*(2), 77-91.

Neches, R., Langley, P., & Klahr, D. (1987). Learning, development, and production systems. In Klahr, D., Langley, P., & Neches, R. (Eds.), *Production system models of learning and development*. Cambridge, MA: Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

Nelson, T. O. (1984). A comparison of current measures of the accuracy of feeling-of-knowing predictions. *Psychological Bulletin, 95*(1), 109-133.

Nerb, J. & Krems, J. (1992). Kompetenzerwerb beim Loesen von Planungsproblemen: experimentelle Befunde und ein SOAR-Model (Skill acquisition in solving scheduling problems: Experimental results and a Soar model.). FORWISS-Report FR-1992-001, Muenchen (Germany).

Neter, J., Wasserman, W., & Kutner, M. H. (1985). *Applied linear statistical models*. Homewood, IL: Irwin.

Neuwirth, C. M., Kaufer, D. S., Chandhok, R., & Morris, J. H. (1990). Issues in the design of

computer support for co-authoring and commenting. *In Proceedings of the Third Conference on Computer Supported Cooperative Work (CSCW'90).* Computer supported cooperative work, Association for Computing Machinery.

Newell, A. (1968). On the analysis of human problem solving protocols. In Gardin, J. C., & Jaulin, B. (Eds.), *Calcul et formalisation dans les sciences de l'homme.* Paris: Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique. Excerpt published in Johnson-Laird, P. J., & Wason, P. C. (1977) (Eds.), "On the analysis of human problem solving protocols", *Thinking: Readings in cognitive science,* 46-61, Bath (UK): The Pitman Press.

Newell, A. (1972). A theoretical exploration of mechanisms for coding the stimulus. In Melton, A. W., & Martin, E. (Eds.), *Coding processes in human memory.* Washington, DC: V. H. Winstor.

Newell, A. (1973). You can't play 20 questions with nature and win. In Chase, W. G. (Ed.), *Visual information processing.* New York, NY: Academic Press.

Newell, A. (1982). The knowledge level. *Artificial Intelligence, 18,* 87-127.

Newell, A. (1990). *Unified theories of cognition.* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Newell, A. (1991). Desires and diversions. School of Computer Science Distinguished Lecture, Carnegie-Mellon University. December 4rth.

Newell, A. (1992). Unified theories of cognition and the role of Soar. In Michon, J. A., & Akyurek, A. (Eds.), *Soar: A cognitive architecture in perspective.* Dordrecht (the Netherlands): Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Newell, A. (1980a). Perception and production of fluent speech. In Cole, R. (Ed.), *Harpy, production systems, and human cognition.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. Also available as CMU tech. report CMU-CS-78-140.

Newell, A. (1980b). Reasoning, problem solving and decision processes: The problem space as a fundamental category. In Nickerson, R. (Ed.), *Attention and performance VIII.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates. Also available as a Department of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University tech report.

Newell, A., & Rosenbloom, P. S. (1981). Mechanisms of skill acquisition and the law of practice. In Anderson, J. R. (Ed.), *Cognitive skills and their acquisition.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Newell, A., & Simon, H. A. (1961). The simulation of human thought. In *Current trends in psychological theory.* Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press. Also available as RAND tech. reports P-1734 and RM-2506.

Newell, A., & Simon, H. A. (1972). *Human Problem Solving.* Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Newell, A., & Steier, D. (1992). Intelligent Control of External Software Systems. *AI in Engineering,* Vol. *in press.* Also available as Technical Report EDRC 05-55-91, Engineering Design Research Center, Carnegie Mellon University, April, 1991.

Newell, A., Shaw, J. C., & Simon, H. A. (1958). Elements of a theory of human problem solving. *Psychological Review, 65,* 151-166.

Newell, A., Shaw, J. C., & Simon, H. A. (1960). Report on a general problem-solving program for a computer. *Information processing: Proceedings of the international conference on*

information processing. Paris, UNESCO, Also available as Rand tech. report P-1584; reprinted in *Computers and Automation*, July 1959..

Newell, A., Yost, G. R., Laird, J. E., Rosenbloom, P. S. & Altmann, E. (1991). Formulating the problem space computational model. In Rashid, R.F. (Ed.), *Carnegie Mellon Computer Science: A 25-Year Commemorative*. Reading, PA: ACM-Press: Addison-Wesley.

Newell, P., Lehman, J., Altmann, E., Ritter, F., & McGinnis, T. (1992). The Soar video. forthcoming.

Norman, D. A. (1990). Approaches to the study of intelligence. *Artificial Intelligence*, Vol. *26*. Also to be published in Kirsh, D. (Ed.) (in preparation). *Foundations of artificial intelligence*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

O'Reilly, R. C. (1991). *X3DNet: An X-Based Neural Network Simulation Environment*. Available from oreilly@cmu.edu, or via anonymous FTP from hydra.psy.cmu.edu as file pub/x3dnet/x3dnet.tar.Z.

Ohlsson, S. (1980). *Competence and strategy in reasoning with common spatial concepts: A study of problem solving in a semantically rich domain*. Doctoral dissertation, U. of Stockholm. Also published as #6 in the Working papers from the Cognitive seminar, Department of Psychology, U. of Stockholm.

Ohlsson, S. (1990). Trace analysis and spatial reasoning: An example of intensive cognitive diagnosis and its implications for testing. In Frederiksen, N., Glaser, R., Lesgold, A., & Shafto, M. G. (Eds.), *Diagnostic monitoring of skill and knowledge acquisition*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Ohlsson, S. (October 1992). Personal communication.

Olson, J. S., Olson, G. M., Storrosten, M., & Carter, M. (1992). How a group-editor changes the character of a design meeting as well as its outcome. Paper presented at the HCI Consortium meeting, February 1992.

Peck, V. A. (November 1992). Personal communication.

Peck, V. A., & John, B. E. (May 1992). Browser-Soar: A computational model of a highly interactive task. *CHI'92 Proceedings of the Conference on Human Factors and Computing Systems*. NewYork, ACM Press.

Pitman, K. M. (1985). *Cref: An editing facility for managing structured text* (Tech. Rep.) A.I. Memo No. 829. Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Artificial Intelligence Laboratory.

Platt, J. R. (1964). Strong Inference. *Science*, *146*(3642), 347-353.

Polk, T. A. (August 1992). *Verbal reasoning*. Doctoral dissertation, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Poltrock, S. E., & Nasr, M. G. (1989). *Protocol analysis: A tool for analyzing human-computer interactions* (Tech. Rep.) ACT-HI-186-89. Microelectronics and Computer Technology Corporation.

Popper, K. R. (1959). *The logic of scientific discovery*. New York, NY: Basic Books.

Priest, A. G., & Young, R. M. (1988). Methods for evaluating micro-theory systems. In Self, J. (Ed.), *Artificial Intelligence and Human Learning: Intelligent Computer-Aided Instruction*. London: Chapman and Hall.

Qin, Y., & Simon, H. A. (1990). Laboratory replication of scientific discovery processes.

Cognitive Science, 14(2), 281-312.

Quinlan, R. (1983). Learning efficient classification procedures and their application to chess end games. In Michalski, R. S., Carbonell, J. G., & Mitchell, T. M. (Eds.), *Machine learning: An artificial intelligence approach.* Palo Alto, CA: Tioga.

Reiser, B. J., Anderson, J. R., & Farrell, R. G. (1985). Dynamic student modeling in an intelligent tutor for LISP programming. *Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence - 85.* Los Angeles: International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence.

Reynolds, H. T. (1984). *Analysis of nominal data* (Tech. Rep.) 07-001. London & Beverly Hills, CA: Sage university paper series on quantitative application in the social sciences.

Ritter, F. E. (September, 1988). "Extending the Seibel-Soar Model". Presented at the Soar V Workshop held at CMU.

Ritter, F. E. (1989). Transparencies from Soar Meeting, May, 1989. FOKIBOFIT-Soar: A Soar model of the effect of problem-part frequency on feeling-of-knowing, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University, Unpublished. Also presented as part of the Understand Seminar, PSY 85-811.

Ritter, F. E. (1991). *TAQL-mode Manual.* The Soar Project, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Ritter, F. E. (February, 1992). "Bruno Levy's Able-Soar, Jr. model". Presented at the Soar X Workshop held at The University of Michigan.

Ritter, F. E., & Fox, D. (1992). *Dismal: A spreadsheet for GNU-Emacs.* The Soar Project, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Ritter, F. E., & McGinnis, T. F. (1992). Manual for *SX: A graphical display and interface for Soar in X windows.* The Soar Project, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Ritter, F. E., Hucka, M., & McGinnis, T. F. (1992). *Soar-mode Manual* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-92-205. School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Rosenbloom, P. S. & Lee, S. (1989). Soar arithmetic and functional capability. Software provided with the Soar 5 distribution.

Rosenbloom, P. S., & Newell, A. (September 1982). *Learning by chunking, a production system model of practice* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-82-135. Department of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Rosenbloom, P. S., Laird, J. E., & Newell, A. (1987). Meta-levels in Soar. In Maes, P., & Nardi, D. (Eds.), *Meta-Level Architectures and Reflection.* Amsterdam: North Holland Publishing Company.

Rumelhart, D. E., McClelland, J. L., & the PDP research group. (1986). *Parallel distributed processing: Explorations in the microstructure of cognition. Volume 1: Foundations.* Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Sakoe, H., & Chiba, S. (1978). Dynamic programming algorithm optimization for spoken word recognition. *IEEE Transactions on acoustics, speech, and signal processing, 26*(1), 43-49.

Samual, A. L. (July 1959). Some studies in machine learning using the game of checkers. *IBM J. of Research and Development, 3,* 210-229.

Sanderson, P. M. (1990). Verbal protocol analysis in three experimental domains using SHAPA. *Proceedings of the Human Factors Society 34th Annual Meeting*. Human Factors Society.

Sanderson, P., James, J., Watanabe, L., & Holden, J. (1990). Human operator behavior in complex worlds: Rendering sequential records analytically tractable. *Proceedings of the 9th Annual Conference on Human Decision Making and Manual Control*. Varese, Italy, Also available from the Engineering Psychology Research Laboratory, Department of Mechanical and Industrial Engineering, U. of Illinois, as technical report EPRL-90-12.

Sanderson, P. M., Verhage, A. G., & Fuld, R. B. (1989). State-space and verbal protocol methods for studying the human operator in process control. *Ergonomics, 32*(11), 1343-1372.

Schank, R. C. (1982). *Dynamic memory*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Schroeder, D. (November 1992). Personal communication.

Shadbolt, N. R., & Wielinga, B. (1990). Knowledge-based knowledge acquisition: the next generation of support tools. In Wielinga, B., Boose, J. H., Gaines, B. R., Schreiber, G., & van Someren, M. (Eds.), *Current trends in Knowledge acquisition (Proceedings of the 4th European workshop on knowledge acquisition, EKAW-90, Amsterdam*. Amsterdam: IOS Press.

Sherwood, B. A., & Sherwood, J. N. (1984). The cT language and its uses: A modern programming tool. In Redish, E. F., & Risley, J. S. (Eds.), *The Conference on Computers in Physics Instruction Proceedings*. Redwood City, CA: Addison-Wesley. Also available as tech report UPITT/LRDC/ONR/APS-14.

Sherwood, B. A., & Sherwood, J. N. (1992). *The cT Language Manual*. Wentworth, NH: Falcon Software. The cT programming language is distributed by Falcon Software, Inc., P.O. Box 200, Wentworth, NH 03282; phone 603-764-5788, fax 603-764-9051. A site license is available for users at CMU.

Shrager, J., Hogg, T., & Huberman, B. A. (1988). A dynamical theory of the power-law of learning in problem-solving. Draft paper submitted to AAAI-88.

Siegler, R. S. (1988). Strategy choice procedures and the development of multiplication skill. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General, 117*(3), 258-275.

Siegler, R. S., & Shrager, J. (1984). Strategy choices in addition and subtraction: How do children know what to do? In Sophian, C. (Ed.), *Origins of cognitive skills*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

ACM Special interest group on Artificial Intelligence. (April 1989). Special issue on: Knowledge Acquisition, *Sigart Newsletter (108)*.

Special interest group on Artificial Intelligence. (1991). Special section on integrated cognitive architectures *Sigart Bulletin, 2(4)*,

Special interest group on Computer-Human Interaction. (1989). Special issue on protocol analysis tools and methods, *SigChi Bulletin, 21(2)*,

Simon, H. A. (1979). *Models of Thought*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Simon, H. A. (1989). *Models of Thought, Volume II*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Simon, H. S. (1990). Invariants of human behavior. *Annual Review of Psychology, 41*, 1-19.

Simon, H. A. (October 1991). Setting up research programs. Talk presented as part of the Graduate student professional seminar series: Interfacing the science and the profession, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Simon, H. A., & Newell, A. (1956). Models: Their uses and limitations. In White, L. D. (Ed.), *The state of the social sciences*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Simon, H. A., & Reed, S. K. (1976). Modeling strategy shifts in a problem-solving task. *Cognitive Psychology, 8*, 86-97.

Simon, D. P., & Simon, H. A. (1978). Individual differences in solving physics problems. In Siegler, R. S. (Ed.), *Children's thinking: What develops?*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Simon, T., Newell, A., & Klahr, D. (1991). A computational account of children's learning about number conservation. In Fisher, D., & Pazzani, M. (Eds.), *Working Models of Human Perception*. Los Altos, California: Morgan Kaufman.

Singley, M. K. (1987). *Developing models of skill acquisition in the context of intelligent tutoring systems*. Doctoral dissertation, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Singley, M. K., & Anderson, J. R. (1989). *The transfer of cognitive skill*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Siochi, A. C., & Hix, D. (1991). A study of computer-supported user interface evaluation using maximal repeating pattern analysis. *Proceedings of the Chi'91*. SIGCHI.

Sleeman, D., Hirsh, H., Ellery, I., & Kim, I. (1990). Extending domain theories: Two cases studies in student modeling. *Machine Learning, 5*, 11-37.

Smith, E. E. (1967). Effects of familiarity on stimulus recognition and categorization. *Journal of Experimental Psychology, 74*(3), 324-332.

Smith, D. (September, 1992a). S-mode version 3.1 (program documentation). Distributed with S-mode.

Smith, D. (September, 1992b). S-mode reference card. Distributed with S-mode.

Stallman, R. M. (1984). EMACS: The extensible, customizable, self-documenting display editor. In Barstow, D. R., Shrobe, H. E., & Sandewall, E. (Eds.), *Interactive programming environments*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill. Extended version of a paper that was published in *Proceedings of the ACM SIGPLAN SIGOA Symposium on text manipulation*, June 1981, Portland, OR, pp. 147-156.

Stone, P. J., Dunphy, D. C, Smith, M. S., & Ogilvie, D. M. with associates. (1966). *The General Inquirer: A computer approach to content analysis*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press.

Suchman, L. (October 1983). Office procedures as practical action: Models of work and system design. *ACM Transactions on Office Information Systems, 1*(4), 320-328.

Swets, J. A. (1973). The relative operating characteristic in psychology. *Science, 182*(7 December 1973), 990-1000.

Swets, J. A. (1986). Indices of discrimination or diagnostic accuracy: Their ROCs and implied models. *Psychological Bulletin, 99*(1), 100-117.

Tesler, L. (January 1983). Enlisting user help in software design. *SIGCHI Bulletin, 14*(3), 5-9.

The Soar group. (24 September 1990). *A brief introduction to Soar and selected readings*. The Soar group, Department of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University. 2 pages.

Thibadeau, R., Just, M. A., & Carpenter, P. A. (1982). A model of the time course and content

of reading. *Cognitive Science, 6,* 157-203.

Toulmin, S. E. (1972). *Human understanding.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Touretzky, D. S. (December, 1986). *A distributed connectionist production system* (Tech. Rep.) CMU-CS-86-172. Computer Science Department, Carnegie Mellon University.

Tufte, E. R. (1990). *Envisioning information.* Cheshire, CT: Graphics Press.

Turing, A. M. (1956). Can a machine think? In Newman, J. R. (Ed.), *The world of mathematics (4).* New York, NY: Simon and Schuster.

Underwood, B. J. (1969). Attributes of memory. *Psychological Review, 76*(6), 559-573.

Unruh, A. (1986). Comprehensive programming project: An interface for Soar. Dept. of Computer Science, Stanford University.

van Gelder, T. (1991). Connectionism and Dynamic Explanation. *Proceedings of the Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society.* Hillsdale, NJ: Cognitive Science Society, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

VanLehn, K. (1989). Human skill acquisition: Theory, model, and psychological validation. *Proceedings of AAAI-83.* Los Altos, CA, Morgan Kaufman.

VanLehn, K., & Garlick, S. (1987). Cirrus: an automated protocol analysis tool. Langley, P. (Ed.), *Proceedings of the Fourth Machine Learning Workshop.* Los Altos, CA, Morgan-Kaufman, also published as Technical Report PCG-6, Departments of Psychology and Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

VanLehn, K., Brown, J. S., & Greeno, J. (1984). Competitive argumentation in computational theories of cognition. In Kintsch, W., Miller, J. R., & Polson, P. G. (Eds.), *Methods and tactics in cognitive science.* Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

VanLehn, K., Jones, R. M., & Chi, M. T. H. (1991). Modeling the self-explanation effect. *Proceedings of the Thirteenth Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society.* Hillsdale, NJ: Cognitive Science Society, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

VanLehn, K., & Ball, W. (1987). *Flexible execution of cognitive procedures* (Tech. Rep.) PCG-5. Departments of Psychology and Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Wagner, R. A., & Fisher, M. J. (1974). The string-to-string correction problem. *J. of the Association for Computing Machinery, 21,* 168-172.

Wagner, D. A., & Scurrah, M. J. (1971). Some characteristics of human problem-solving in chess. *Cognitive Psychology, 2,* 454-478.

Waldrop, M. M. (July 1988). Soar: A Unified Theory of Cognition? *Science, 241,* 296-298.

Waltz, D. L. (January 1987). Applications of the Connection Machine. *IEEE Computer, 20*(1), 85-97.

Ward, B. (May 1991). *ET-Soar: Toward an ITS for Theory-Based Representations.* Doctoral dissertation, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Waterman, D. (1973). Pas-II reference manual, Version 29. Copies are currently available from Herb Simon and Frank Ritter, Department of Psychology, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Waterman, D. A., & Newell, A. (1971). Protocol Analysis as a task for artificial intelligence. *Artificial Intelligence, 2,* 285-318. Shorter version published as Waterman, D.A. and Newell, A., (1971). Protocol Analysis as a Task for Artificial Intelligence, in *Proceedings of the Second*

International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI).

Waterman, D. A., & Newell, A. (1973). *Pas-II: An interactive task-free version of an automatic protocol analysis system* (Tech. Rep.). Department of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University. Also included in the preprints for the Third International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence.

Wickens, T. D. (1982). *Models for behavior: Stochastic processes in psychology.* San Francisco: W. H. Freeman and Company.

Winikoff, A. (1967). *Eye movements as an aid to protocol analysis of problem solving behavior.* Doctoral dissertation, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Yost, G.R. (March 1992). *TAQL: A Problem Space Tool for Expert System Development.* Doctoral dissertation, School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University.

Yost, G.R., & Altmann, E. (1991). TAQL 3.1.3: Soar Task Acquisition Language User Manual. School of Computer Science, Carnegie-Mellon University, 19 December, 1991. Unpublished.

Yost, G. R., & Newell, A. (1989). A problem space approach to expert system specification. *Proceedings of the Eleventh International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence.* IJCAI.

Young, R. M. (1973). *Children's seriation behavior: a production-system analysis.* Doctoral dissertation, Carnegie-Mellon University. Also published as C.I.P. report #245.

Young, R. M. (1979). Production systems for modeling human cognition. In Michie, D. (Ed.), *Expert systems in the micro-electronic age.* Edinburgh (UK): The University Press.

Young, R. M., & O'Shea, T. (1981). Errors in children's subtraction. *Cognitive Science, 5,* 153-177.